Using Digital Primary Sources to Teach Historical Perspective to Preservice Teachers

Scott M. Waring
University of Central Florida

Cheryl A. Franklin Torrez
The University of New Mexico

Abstract

This article focuses on the use of digital primary sources to teach historical perspective to preservice teachers. Discussed here are the experiences of 90 elementary education majors during their inquiry-based elementary social studies methods course. A variety of digital primary sources were used to teach historical perspective and to model teaching strategies for use in elementary classrooms. The preservice teachers indicated that their experiences were positive, that digital sources had great potential for elementary classroom use in providing students with multiple perspectives, and that they gave the teacher an opportunity to make history real, challenge assumptions, and foster inquiry, as well as help the students to understand the content more clearly.

Social scientists conventionally have used primary sources, such as clothing, letters, photographs, census records, maps, and manuscripts, as evidence when conducting historical inquiries (Barton, 1997, 2001; Levstik & Barton, 2005; Library of Congress, 2003). Traditionally, primary sources are rarely used in elementary classrooms or in elementary preservice social studies methods courses (Fresch, 2004), although elementary-aged students enjoy working with primary sources, can critically analyze them, and have been found to utilize them in the creation of historical narratives (Barton, 1997). The minimal use of primary sources in elementary social studies has been due, in the past, primarily to the lack of availability of primary sources and lack of time available to educators for locating primary sources.
The lack of use can also be attributed to several other factors: (a) students’ lack of understanding about how history is interpreted (Barton, 1996; Downey & Levstik, 1991; Morris, Morgan-Fleming, & Janisch, 2001), (b) teachers’ epistemological assumptions about the nature of knowledge and how it is generated (Lee, 1998; VanSledright, 1998; VanSledright, 2002a), (c) a lack of understanding about historical thinking processes (Bohan & Davis, 1998; Thornton & Vukelich, 1988; Yeager & Davis, 1994), and (d) a lack of deep content knowledge or perceptions toward teaching social studies content for the average elementary social studies teacher (Gillaspie & Davis, 1997-8; Goodman & Adler, 1985).

Technology has now allowed educators to connect with more and more resources outside of the classroom, so acquisition of primary source materials is easier today than ever (Lee, 2002). Increasingly in the social studies, the literature addresses ways in which elementary and secondary teachers use technology to facilitate the learning of content (Berson & Bennett, 2009; Lee, 2002). In addition to increased access to technological resources, there is substantial evidence that elementary age students are able to engage effectively in authentic historical inquiry (Barton, 1997, 2001; Barton & Levstik, 1994; Fallace, Biscoe, & Perry, 2007; Fertig, 2005; Levstik & Barton, 2005; VanSledright, 2002b).

If educators expect students to understand how the history they read in texts, magazines, books, and on historically based Internet sites was interpreted and constructed, students must be allowed the opportunity to authentically create history in a manner similar to that of a professional historian (Barton, 1997). This process of authentic investigation is commonly referred to as disciplined inquiry or historical inquiry (Avery, 2000; Levstik & Barton, 2005; Scheurman & Newmann, 1998). Disciplined inquiry can be thought of as the investigation of personally relevant and intriguing questions in authentic ways. As students conduct historical inquiry, the related instruction should explicitly focus on helping students to weigh historical evidence, examine biases, synthesize information, and reach conclusions so students understand that the accounts they read are subjective and are the creation of an author who has biases, motives, and beliefs (Barton, 1997).

**Background**

This article describes the experiences of elementary education majors during their social studies methods course. We used digital primary sources to teach historical perspective and to model historical inquiry teaching strategies for use in elementary classrooms. Due to previous experiences and personal philosophical beliefs, we did not begin with an assumption that through these preliminary lessons all of the students would be able to achieve expert historical thinking capacities or be fully prepared to integrate historical inquiry based assignments in their future classrooms. However, we hoped to introduce students to the ideas and processes of historical inquiry, primary sources, historical perspective, and to what it means to think historically.

**Methodology**

The goals of this study were (a) to examine students’ impressions regarding their use of digital primary sources in social studies methods courses, (b) to better understand how these impressions related to understanding of content, and (c) to determine implications for K-6 classroom instruction.
Participants

The 90 participants in this study were elementary education majors at two large metropolitan universities. The participants ranged in age from 19 to 47, and 87% were female. 62% were Caucasian, 16% were African American, 14% were Hispanic, and 8% were other. These identifiers were not utilized during the analysis of the data.

A convenient sample method was used in participant selection. The researchers were the instructors of record of the methods courses in which all the activities and subsequent data collection occurred. All participants had the option of refusal of their coursework and discourse for research purposes.

Data Collection

All of the data were collected during elementary methods courses in the fall and spring semesters of one academic year. Data were collected from students in four elementary social studies methods courses throughout each semester. Multiple sources were used to collect data in order to enhance validity (Frenkel & Wallen, 1996). Data included observation field notes, students’ work with comments, and responses to prompted questions. These multiple sources allowed for saturation of categories and for combining of procedures, thereby ensuring a more thorough and practical analysis (Creswell, 1998, 2003). The responses to and analysis of the prompted questions served as a framework for the data analysis and for presenting the findings.

At the conclusion of the final class period, we posted the following two questions on the board:

1. In what ways has the use of digital primary sources enhanced your understanding of content?
2. What are some implications of digital primary sources for elementary students in general?

The participants were informed that they did not have to participate, as participation or failure to participate would not affect their grade in the course and that no identifying information should be provided with their responses. Participants were instructed to respond in their own words on a sheet of paper provided by the instructor and to leave their responses on a back table of the classroom as they exited the room at the conclusion of the class period.

Data Analysis

All were analyzed using a constant-comparative method to find themes among the data (Glaser & Strauss, 1967). Triangulation of data was used to provide a deeper understanding of students’ impressions (Denzin & Lincoln, 1998). We collected all of the responses and typed all comments into two separate word processing documents, one for the ways in which the use of digital primary sources enhanced the students’ understanding of content (coded as enhanced) and the other for perceived implications of the use of digital primary sources with elementary students (coded as implications). The data were reviewed on multiple occasions to determine intended meanings (Rossman & Rollis, 2003). In addition, attention to keeping internal convergence and external divergence was essential, so efforts were made to ensure that as data were analyzed and categorized each category remained internally consistent while being mutually exclusive (Marshall & Rossman, 1999).
As the comments were analyzed, several themes emerged from the data. We categorized each comment according to which theme each was most closely aligned. For the naming of identifying themes, indigenous typologies (Patton, 1990; Rossman & Rollis, 2003) were used, as we felt it was important to keep the language and implications authentic and original throughout the analysis process. From the question, “In what ways has the use of digital primary sources enhanced your understanding of content?,” the following theme identifiers were used: (a) made history real, (b) challenged assumptions, (c) helped them to understand content, (d) multiple perspectives, and (e) fostered inquiry.

For the question, “What are some implications of digital primary sources for elementary students in general?,” similar generalizations emerged, so the same categories were used. Each researcher coded all data with the question and theme identifier, and results were compared. All efforts were made to minimize the imposition of researcher bias during the analysis process (Strauss & Corbin, 1998) and to view the data as closely to the intended meanings as possible. If any disagreement to category placement or meaning of comment was present, we discussed it and, if any further disagreement existed, the comment was not used.

Description of Activities

Students were introduced to the terms primary sources, historical thinking, historical inquiry, and digital history through the use of the Internet and other modes of technology. In conducting these digital history based activities with these students, we utilized Lee’s (2002) concept of digital history:

Digital history is the study of the past using a variety of electronically reproduced primary source texts, images, and artifacts as well as the constructed historical narratives, accounts, or presentations that result from digital historical inquiry. Digital historical resources are typically stored as electronic collections in formats that facilitate their use on the World Wide Web. (pp. 504-505)

In order to model effective uses of technology integration, technology was used only when the instructor believed that it allowed students to do things that could not be done without technology or at least in an easier manner. Dawson and Harris (1999) encouraged teachers to decide whether an activity that incorporates the use of technology is worth the time, effort, and expense spent. The methods instructors in this study evaluated the methods and resources used in terms of these guidelines.

**Primary sources.** In order to model teaching with digital primary sources, one of the first lessons taught was “how to teach elementary students about primary sources and how to begin analyzing primary sources with younger students” (Torrez & Waring, 2009; Waring, Santana, & Robinson, 2009). Initially, the students participated in a Hide and Seek lesson, in which the students viewed a primary source photograph and were asked to “hide” themselves somewhere in the photo. The instructor proceeded to attempt to find each of the students in the image, while asking a variety of sensory questions, such as “What do you see from your location?” “What do you hear?” and so forth.

A follow-up lesson was a Mind Walk activity (Library of Congress, 2002). (Editor’s note: Website URLs can be found in the Resources section at the end of this paper.) During this activity, students listed everything they had done in a 24-hour period and listed any evidence, electronic, tangible, and so forth, that may be left behind from each activity. For example, a coffee cup and newspaper may be evidence from someone’s morning routine. Conversation about evidence led to discussions about that particular
individual or society as a whole in that locale and time. These initial activities provided a foundation for the preservice teachers, as well as to model teaching strategies for elementary classroom use.

**History as constructed.** In a lesson about the Battle at Lexington Green during the American Revolution, students were presented with a variety of essays describing the events leading up to the battle and how the battle itself unfolded (Waring, 2007). The students were able to gather from the information provided that many different interpretations exist. After a discussion about these secondary accounts, the students met in small groups and were given a set of six paintings, dates of production ranging from 1775 to 1875 (Revolutionary Viewpoints; Bigham, Joseph, & Resch, 2002).

The students were asked to answer a set of questions in their groups regarding the depiction of the battle in these paintings. They were given no formal guidance throughout the lesson, as we hoped that they would be able to derive their own interpretation of the events through the use of the digital primary and secondary sources presented to them. This lesson gave the students the opportunity to see firsthand the subjective nature of historical narratives and art work.

**Timelines.** During another class period, the students were introduced to visual timelines in order to orient them to a particular time period (Waring, 2005). We felt that proper modeling of the use of visual timelines was critical, as reflected in the following statement by Levstik and Barton (2001),

> Time lines can be found in any history text and on the walls of many classrooms. However, we believe that most time lines do little to develop students’ understanding because they provide no connection with prior knowledge. For a time line to be effective, it must build on students’ prior knowledge—their visual understanding of changes in social and material life. (p. 87)

The students were asked to present a visual timeline on a time period or topic of individual interest or association, using any available online primary sources (such as photographs, paintings, and collages). The students used several different software packages (Pinnacle Studio, iMovie, Microsoft Word, etc.) to create their visual timeline, although Microsoft PowerPoint tended to be the most popular.

**Perspective.** One of the most prevalent strands running through the courses was perspective: historical, personal, and cultural. As historical perspective was addressed, the students participated in an artifact bag activity, during which they were given the opportunity to view various primary sources and discuss each item’s relevance to the topic of discovery. In this case, the topic was World War II on the American home front. This topic was chosen because World War II is generally considered a meaningful
historical event. Barton (1997) indicated that effective primary source investigations conducted early in the historical inquiry learning process should be on meaningful historic events.

The World War II artifact bags consisted of ration coupons, images and posters, chewing gum, advertisements, metal lipstick tubes, nylon stockings, and other items important to the investigation of the American home front. This activity is important, as the process of comparing and contrasting primary source artifacts is a basic skill of historical inquiry. Students should be given opportunities to investigate and analyze various primary sources and compare their findings with classmates to gain a better understanding of the historical inquiry process (Barton, 2001).

Several additional digital sources were downloaded and investigated with the students to practice and better understand the process of thinking like an historian (sourcing, contextualizing, close reading, and corroborating; see Why Historical Thinking Matters). These included portions of documentary movies on Japanese Internment camps produced by the U.S. War Relocation Authority (Challenge to Democracy) and the U.S. Office of War Information (Japanese Relocation) and primary sources from the Library of Congress (Japanese American Internment During World War II Primary Source Set).

The materials from the Library of Congress included an Interview with Marielle Tsukamoto: A First-hand Account of Japanese Internment, Civilian Exclusion Order Number 33, and Executive Order 9066. These two orders mandated the internment of Japanese Americans in the United States during the World War II. Additionally, poems written by internees (War Relocation Authority Camps in Arizona) were located online and read by the preservice teachers. An elementary trade book, Baseball Saved Us (Mochizuki, 1995), was read to and discussed by the students.

Findings

Not surprisingly, a good deal of time was spent on helping the participants understand primary sources. Many of the students indicated that they had never heard the term or had the opportunity to work with primary source materials. However, the availability of digital primary sources was pivotal in providing the students with an abundance of primary source materials for a variety of perspectives on topics such as Japanese internment, the Civil War, and political ideologies. Additionally, some of the technologies used were new to the preservice teachers. Several of the students had limited experience...
in using Web browsers and downloading resources found on the Web. We found that computer technology connected the methods students with resources outside of the classroom that were new to nearly all of the students.

Once these initial barriers were addressed, the students embraced digital resources. They indicated that their experiences were positive and that digital resources had great potential for elementary classroom use. However, a persistent caveat was the perceived lack of computer availability and lack of time within elementary classrooms.

**Enhancing Content Understanding**

Several themes emerged from the data collected from the first research question. The students indicated that the use of primary sources made history real to them, helped them challenge assumptions, helped them understand content, and helped see perspective. Additionally, the data illustrated that inquiry was fostered.

**Made history real.** Nearly all of the students noted that digital primary sources made history real to them. One student indicated, “It makes the ideas more real, more interesting.” Another student wrote, “When I have hard evidence, I can more easily compare them. By juxtaposing two events, I can be more aware of their characteristics. Content becomes real.” Another captured the responses of many in just a few words, “Seeing is believing—seeing real documents makes the experience real.”

Many of the students were appreciative that the instructors made the effort to integrate digital primary sources into their teaching and make history more alive and enjoyable. One student commented, “This was the first time that I have ever taken a college course that integrated digital primary sources. These sources were awesome, since they made history come alive.” Another stated, “Having the accessibility to countless documents makes things real—rather than talking about a document or picture you’re able to actually see it—that has a much more powerful impact on me.”

Some were amazed that these sorts of materials were available through digital sources and were thankful that they were exposed to the primary sources, as well as to the electronic resources to access them. One student noted, “Seeing actual documents, photos, and films from an actual time in history makes them even seem more ‘real’ to me; I had no idea these primary sources are out there.”

One student captured the sentiment of the participants, “You can go into greater depth by using primary sources; this helps me understand history. Digital primary sources allow us to feel as if we are part of the experience. Content becomes more meaningful and alive.” This response characterized the feelings of many students that the use of digital primary sources allowed historical events to seem more real to them as they learned about people, places, and events firsthand, even though they were removed from the content they were learning by years, decades, and even centuries. When thinking about how the use of digital primary sources enhanced the reality of the Japanese internment experience, one student noted,

It made it real to me. Looking at the pictures of Minidoka, I was able to place myself there. All of those powerful sources like the poem and interviews made me actually FEEL the content I was learning. The images I have seen will always be in my memory.
**Challenged assumptions.** For many of the students, digital primary sources served as a vehicle to challenge their beliefs and assumptions. Thus, they engaged in the process of historical inquiry. One student wrote, “I had no idea that I’ve spent most of my life misinformed.” The digital primary sources and the resulting inquiry created dissonance for many of our students, and although not always a pleasant process, the result of having assumptions challenged led one student to indicate, “I was taught the Disney version of history, and it seemed like nothing bad ever happened.”

**Helped them understand content.** Many of the responses given by the students related the researchers’ use of digital primary sources and how the integration of digital primary sources helped them better understand the content being presented (e.g., Battle of Lexington Green and Japanese Internment Camps). They felt that the use of these primary sources by K-16 students when covering historical information “really helps to open their eyes and get their minds thinking about the content being covered.”

One student wrote, “It is a great way for students to experience the content at first hand. They can see and hear the speeches, look at pictures, and have a realization of what history was like.” Another indicated that it “gave a realistic sense of what was being discussed, something tangible to illustrate a concept.” Some students shared that using digital primary sources enabled them to have a much deeper understanding of the content that was being taught. One student responded that primary sources allowed him to engage with the topic at hand and how he “really got a feel for what history is all about, how interesting and enjoyable it really can be.”

Several statements about the way digital primary sources enhance the understanding of content were related to the lessons on the social aspects and daily life in the Japanese internment camps and the United States, as a whole, during the World War II. One student noted that the digital sources used to portray the life of individuals within the internment camps “were an eye opener for me and allowed me to better understand the events of that action.” When discussing the artifact bag lesson and how it allowed the students to understand the lifestyle of people living in the United States during the World War II, one student said “using digital primary sources for the artifact bag activity allowed a visual aid in understanding the WWII time period.”

Overall, when students made comments about how using digital primary sources improved the acquisition of historical content, they mentioned aspects of how it gave them something visual or tangible to assist them in their learning process. Many of the individuals’ feelings were summarized in the following quote:

The use of digital primary sources has enhanced my understanding of content by providing me with concrete examples. These sources give me a first hand glimpse of the meaning of the content. I am a very visual person and so are many students. Using pictures enriches the learning experience.

**Multiple perspectives.** Another theme that emerged was perspective. The use of digital primary sources showed the students, as one student put it, “many different ways things happened and many different perspectives.” Another stated that these sources allowed students “to see a variety of perspectives that would not have been available otherwise. Because of the different perspectives, it gives us a more well [sic] rounded view of the content.” One student noted that it “allows me to look at sides not considered through the textbooks.” Generally, the responses reflected a feeling that “it is easier to understand a subject when there is more than one perspective of it.”
The students began to see that the “sources broaden what is available” to them as educators. Furthermore, some conveyed that “these sources take me to places I could otherwise not go such as to Virginia and D.C. I am able to learn more about a concept as well as learn multiple perspectives on the content.”

As this was the first time many of the students were given the opportunity to view a historical event from multiple perspectives, several students indicated that they became frustrated and irritated with the way history has been presented to them in the past. One student stated, “I feel as I have had a chance to see more views of many things. For so long, all we have been given is the textbook version. Whose perspective is that?” It also allowed them to think more freely rather than being given the textbook author’s perspective: “I felt that the digital primary sources helped me establish my own thinking about a situation. They were unbiased.”

Several students mentioned aspects of using digital sources to help them better understand military events, such as the lesson on the Battle of Lexington. One student shared that this lesson “showed the different aspects of the same historical event.” It allowed them to create their own interpretation of the event. Several students felt that the use of digital primary sources in this way enhanced, as one student put it, “the understanding of content in that the ‘truth’ was easily seen from the actual primary sources. Just like when we did ‘The Battle of Lexington’ project and compared all of the different versions of what happened in that battle.”

**Fostered inquiry.** All of the methods students in these courses were elementary education majors. For many of them, our courses were the first time they engaged in historical inquiry, and they indicated that the use of digital primary sources allowed them to engage in historical inquiry and in a way that may not have been possible without technology or at least in an easier way. The students developed a greater understanding of the historical content that we addressed in class, but they also began asking more questions; hence, inquiry was fostered. One student wrote, “Even by looking at the pictures, it makes me want to know more.” For several students, digital primary sources inspired “lots of questions which also lead to more and more inquiry, and they open my creative inquiry.”

**Implications of Digital Primary Sources for Elementary Students**

The responses to the second research question correspond with the responses to the first question. Overall, the methods students strongly indicated that, as one student put it, “The primary sources will do for children what they did for me. History will become alive for them.” Students averred that using primary sources to teach historical events meets the needs of various types of learners (tactile, visual, aural, etc.), and as one noted, it “brings them into the past so that they can better understand the future.” Through the utilization of the Internet, the students began to see that primary sources were able to help them to, according to one student, “conceptualize and visualize topics.” They felt that it was essential to incorporate the use of digital primary sources into the teaching of historical information to elementary aged children, exemplified by one emphatic response in regards to their use, “I think they are crucial for kids!"

Several of the students learned that using primary sources allows learners to become historians and find themselves authentically involved in the process of historical inquiry. This thought was illustrated in the subsequent comment:
The use of digital primary sources in the classroom familiarizes students with how to research events and people in history and, therefore, would help equip them with the skills necessary to develop and complete their own research with the use of technology.

Additionally, several students noted that the instructor’s use of primary sources and the utilization of the Internet was a shock, as they were not aware of the amount of resources available to them as teachers. This feeling was characterized in the following statement:

I realized that there are so many other resources that I can use to learn and teach the content. Many times I have felt restricted into using the text as my only resource, but now I have been informed that the text does not always tell the full truth and it is to my benefit and my students to research other sources.

One student suggested that it “makes getting away from the textbook as the main source of information easier.”

Several class discussions centered on the necessity of teachers finding ways to make learning more personally relevant and attempting to relate the content to their students’ lives, interests, and so forth, in hopes that they will remember the information for a greater period of time and more accurately. The students were shown that the use of primary sources can help in the attainment of that goal. One student stated in regards to primary sources,

I think, overall, they only enhance the learning experience and provide a clearer picture of the events being discussed. In some instances, you are even able to get the children completely involved as if they were participating in the event themselves. I think that type of learning experience leaves a lasting impression rather than just giving information for that moment.

**Discussion**

One of the challenges that content methods professors often face is finding the balance between teaching discipline-related content and teaching instructional strategies and methods. As social studies methods instructors, we are committed to helping future teachers learn to teach; without knowledge of what to teach, our attempts are futile. We attempted to find the proper balance, by using digital primary sources and historical inquiry-based assignments with our elementary preservice teachers. In a future study, it would be beneficial to examine the content gained by the participants, in addition to the perceptions of the methods used.

Clearly, the use of digital primary sources enhanced the participants’ understanding of historical content. As stated previously, all of the students were elementary education majors with limited backgrounds in the social sciences. History became real to many of the students for the first time. Many of their assumptions and beliefs were challenged. Thus, the researchers were encouraged that some experienced a sense of dissonance, an essential component of the process of moving novices toward a more expert level of historical thinking and understanding.

One student viewed primary sources as “unbiased.” This view is contrary to what we believe was taught within the courses and a vital concept for future social studies educators to learn. Thus, the instructional methods used are being reevaluated, in order
to better ensure that students realize the biased nature of both primary and secondary accounts.

We had hoped that the use of digital primary sources would allow us to help the students develop historical perspective, and the results indicate the fruition of initial hopes. What we do not know, however, is whether these future teachers will use digital primary sources to teach historical content to their elementary students.

The overall feeling characterized in the students’ statements to the second research question was that the use of digital primary sources will make it much easier for the teachers to present historical content, although this was contrary to what VanSledright (2002b) found while utilizing primary sources with fifth graders. They also believed that the primary sources will allow the students to connect prior knowledge and experiences to the new content being learned. Ultimately, students felt that, as one student contended, “Pictures, primary documents, film, and music all enhance the learning experience so that it will be remembered not for a day but for years to come.”

Granted, these participants did not possess an expert level of historical understanding or mastery of historical content, so they may not have the capacity to analyze fully the process used and extrapolate ideas as to how primary sources can and should be used in the elementary grades. We found that students benefited from the procedures employed; however, a good deal of naiveté still existed. Thoughts were still present that a “full truth” exists and that sources can be “unbiased.” Nonetheless, we believe that these results, in addition to what we know about teaching history in the elementary grades, can be quite useful for elementary methods course instructors when developing curriculum with the intention of beginning the process of moving their students from a novice to an expert level of understanding.

With proper scaffolding, students beginning in the elementary grades have the ability to conduct historical inquiries and evaluate primary sources (Barton, 1997, 2001; Barton & Levstik, 1994; Levstik & Barton, 2005). University faculty should correctly model the use of digital primary sources and historical inquiry-based assignments in their elementary methods courses, as this might be the only place that elementary majors have the opportunity to witness these firsthand. Brush and Saye (2009) offered strategies to help enable higher education faculty a way to enhance preservice social studies teachers’ understanding of how to apply models and practices for effectively integrating technology into social studies teaching and, thus, improve their technological pedagogical content knowledge (Brush, 1998; Brush et al., 2003).

Barton and Levstik (1994) found that in the elementary grades history instruction should “focus upon helping students refine and extend the knowledge they have gained about history” (pp. 33-34), and Barton (1997) posited that “students need systematic exposure to the collection and evaluation of historical evidence” (p. 423). Teacher educators need to examine carefully the practices used in their elementary methods courses, as elementary-aged students will not have this opportunity if proper techniques are not provided within this arena (Seixas, 1998). When these techniques are not properly taught in the social studies methods courses, elementary teachers may fall back upon the practices that were used during their K-12 schooling. This “apprenticeship of observation” (Lortie, 1975) is likely the worst scenario possible.
References


Resources


Revolutionary Viewpoints - http://www.cyberbee.com/viewpoints/


War Relocation Authority Camps in Arizona - http://parentseves.arizona.edu/wracamps/thatdamnedfence.html

Why Historical Thinking Matters - http://historicalthinkingmatters.org/why.html

Author Notes

Scott M. Waring
University of Central Florida
Email: swaring@mail.ucf.edu

Cheryl A. Franklin Torrez
The University of New Mexico
Email: catorrez@unm.edu